BIEN - BASIC INCOME EUROPEAN NETWORK

BIEN was founded in 1986 and aims to serve as a link between individuals and groups committed to or interested in basic income, and to foster informed discussion on this topic throughout Europe.

NewsFlash 26, March 2004

BIEN's NewsFlash is mailed electronically every two months to over 1000 subscribers throughout Europe and beyond.

Requests for free subscription and items for inclusion or review in future NewsFlashes are to be sent to BIEN's secretary: Philippe Van Parijs, UCL, Chaire Hoover, 3 Place Montesquieu, 1348 Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium, <mailto:bien@basicincome.org>.

Owing to some difficulties encountered by our webmaster, our website has not been updated recently, but it will be updated again quite soon: http://www.basicincome.org.

The present NewsFlash has been prepared with the help of James Hughes, Jens-Eberhard Jahn, Jose Noguera, Yannick Vanderborght, Bruno Van der Linden, Karl Widerquist.

CONTENTS

1. Editorial

- 2. BIEN's 10th Congress (Barcelona, 19-20 September 2004)
- 2.1. Plenary sessions
- * 2.2. Panels
- * 2.3. Call for papers
- * 2.4. Pre-registration

3. Other events

- Washington (US), 20-22/2/04: Third Congress of USBIG
- * Bergen (NO), 27/2/04: Basic Income vs Workfare
- * Madrid (ES), 10 & 24/3/04: Las propuestas del ingreso basico
- * Berlin (DE), 16/4/04: Modelle der Grundsicherung
- * Louvain-la-Neuve (BE), 13/5/04: Les syndicats contre l'allocation universelle?
- * Paris (FR), 24/6/04: Le dividende universel
- * Freiberg (DE), 25/6/04: Prospects for a basic income in Germany
- 4. Glimpses of national debates
- Belgium: Prime Minister's Party in a coalition with Duchatelet's Basic Income Party
- 5. Recent publications
- * English: Dowding, De Wispelaere & White eds, Van der Linden, Wright ed.
- * German: Merle

6. About BIEN

1. EDITORIAL

With two new English-language collective volumes on basic income versus basic endowment, and with five meeting on basic income in five months in five different European countries, the discussion on basic income continues unabated through a great many individual initiatives.

Our Barcelona congress will be another opportunity for many people interested in basic income to come together, take stock, discuss, and fill up with renewed energy. The deadline for the call for papers was the 31st of March. If you forgot it, and would still like your proposal to be considered by the scientific committee, please send it immediately to Prof. Jose Noguera.

The Executive Committee

2. TENTH CONGRESS OF THE BASIC INCOME EUROPEAN NETWORK

"The Right to a Basic Income: Egalitarian Democracy"

Barcelona (Spain), 19-20 September 2004 www.redrentabasica.org

The Congress is being held within the framework of the Universal Forum of Cultures, as part of the Dialogue on "*Human Rights, Emerging Needs and New Opportunities*" organised by Catalonia's Institute of Human Rights (18-21 September 2004). The location is a huge new site developed along the sea, to the East of the Olympic Village, within easy reach of the city centre by public transport. The BIEN congress itself will occupy Sunday the 19th and Monday the 20th of September. The definitive programme will be ready by the end of May 2004.

2.1. PLENARY SESSIONS

Confirmed plenary speakers include Gosta Esping-Andersen, Nancy Fraser, Desmond King, Angelika Krebs, Stuart White, Christine Boutin, Katja Kipping, Ricard Gomà, Eduardo Suplicy, Rubén Lo Vuolo, Ingrid van Niekerk, and Claus Offe, Guy Standing and Philippe Van Parijs as chairs. The possibility of a closing speech by Brazil's President Lula da Silva is still being negotiated. Prominent Catalan and Spanish politicians are being contacted for the opening and closing sessions, including Jordi Sevilla, Spain's new minister for Public Administration, known to be very sympathetic towards basic income.

2.2. PANELS

So far, seven panel sessions are completely full. Three are still being finalized. And two have been cancelled, thus freeing some space for individual papers or other panel sessions. The local organisers want to thank the splendid work of the coordinators so far. The completed panel sessions at present are the following:

- 1) Basic Income and the Right to Work (coord. Philip Harvey).
- 2) Basic Income and Democratic Republicanism (coord. Daniel Raventós & David Casassas).
- 3) Basic Income as a Trade Union Policy (coord. Alex Boso & Sergi Raventós).
- 4) Basic Income as a Policy for Fighting Against Child Labour (coord. Eduardo Calderón).
- 5) Innovative and Sustainable Financing for Basic Income (coord. Gianluca Busilacchi).
- 6) From Aspiration to Policy Implementation: Introducing a Basic Income System Category by Category (coord. Sean J. Healy).
- 7) After Workfare (coord. Yannick Vanderborght).

2.3. CALL FOR PAPERS

The deadline for sending paper proposals was 31 March. Many have been received, including an exceptionally high number from Southern countries, especially Latin America. Late proposals can still be sent, but very urgently, to the programme co-ordinator jose.noguera@uab.es (title and abstract of max. 100 words in English). Acceptance or refusal of the proposals will be notified as soon as possible, and in any event no later than 31 May. The full version of accepted papers must reach the programme coordinator before 31 July.

2.4. PRE-REGISTRATION

It is already possible to pre-registrate in the Forum Dialogue "Human rights, emerging needs and new developments", within the framework of which the BIEN Congress will be held (along with five more congresses). You will then receive updated information about the Dialogue and the registration procedures and. In order to pre-register, go

to www.barcelona2004.org/eng/eventos/dialogos/ficha.cfm?IdEvento=185, click on "Preregistration", fill in the form and send it. More information about the whole Dialogue are also available from this website.

3. OTHER EVENTS

WASHINGTON (US), 20-22 February 2004: 3rd CONGRESS OF USBIG

The third congress of the US Basic Income Guarantee Network took place in Washington, DC at the Hyatt Regency on Capitol Hill. It attracted a wide variety of submissions, including from medical doctors, Post Keynesian economists, and homeless advocates.

The first speaker was Philip Wogaman, Bill Clinton's former pastor and the author of Guaranteed Annual Income: The Moral Issues (1968), written when the Nixon administration was toying with the idea of

replacing welfare by Milton Friedman's negative income tax. To the question "Is it moral to give people things they haven't earned?", Wogaman replies that we all receive things we haven't earned, from childhood on. People who believe they earned everything they have ignore all the unearned advantages they have received. A basic income is simply an extension of this recognition that we all stand on each other's shoulders.

The climax of the congress was an emotional meeting between Jay Hammond, former governor of Alaska and father of the world's first genuine basic income scheme, and Eduardo Suplicy, member of Brazil's federal senate and father of the world's first national basic income law. Suplicy presented the new law to phase in basic income in Brazil, while Hammond discussed the current effort to increase the size of the Alaska fund a part of a bill to close the state's budget gap. Recurrent questions throughout the meeting included the question of the relative advantages of an unconditional basic income, of a right to a job provided by the government as an employer of last resort and of a caregiver's credit for care activities; the question of using natural resources (as proposed for Iraq and Nigeria on the Alaska model), land, broadcast spectrum rights, pollution permits or progressive taxation for funding the scheme; and the question of where political support for the scheme would be found.

(Based on accounts by Karl Widerquist for USBIG and James Hughes for cyberdemocracy.net.) For further information, http://www.usbig.net/ and http://www.usbig.net/ and http://www.usbig.net/ and http://www.usbig.net/

BERGEN (NO), 27 February 2004: BASIC INCOME VERSUS WORKFARE
A one-day workshop organised by Nanna Kildal, senior research at the Rokkan Institute and editor of Den nya sociala fragan. Om arbete, inkomst och rättvisa (Göteborg: Daidalos, 2001), with the participation of economists, political scientists and sociologists from the Universities of Oslo and Bergen and other research institutions. Guest speaker Philippe Van Parijs (Université catholique de Louvain) opened the morning session with a talk on "Basic income and Workfare. Two versions of the active social state". The afternoon session started with commentaries by Hilde Bojer (Oslo) and Alexander Cappelen (Oslo).

MADRID (ES), 10 & 24 March 2004: LAS PROPUESTAS DEL INGRESO BASICO A two-part seminar organised by the Financial and Tax law section of the Faculty of Law of Madrid's Jesuit University (Universidad Comillas), with the participation of Evaristo Palomar Maldonado, Leopoldo Gonzalo González,

José Luis Rey Pérez, and Javier Alonso Madrigal, all from the Law Faculty of Comillas University. For further information: "Jose Luis Rey Perez" < <u>ilrey@der.upco.es</u>>

BERLIN, 16 April 2004: MODELLE DER GRUNDSICHERUNG

For further information: "Nanna Kildal" < Nanna. Kildal@rokkan.uib.no>.

The first of a series of seminars on alternative social policy organised by the Rosa Luxemburg Foundation (linked to the PDS, itself heir to the East-German communist party), with a special interest in basic security/ basis income models.

For further information: brangsch@rosalux.de or "Kipping, Katja" < Katja.Kipping@slt.sachsen.de >

LOUVAIN-LA-NEUVE, 13 May 2004: LES SYNDICATS CONTRE L'ALLOCATION UNIVERSELLE?

A workshop (in French) on the problematic relationship between basic income and the Trade Union movement, with the participation of Sabine Wernerus, author of a thesis on the subject at

the Open Faculty of Louvain University, Jean-Pierre Thorel , Swiss Trade Unionist and former Chairman of Switzerland's Economic and Social Council, Thierry Bodson, regional secretary of Belgium's socialist Trade Union Federation (FGTB) and Paul Palsterman, senor researcher at Belgium's Christian Trade Union Federation (CSC). The workshop is organised by Yannick Vanderborght, researcher at the Chaire Hoover and author of a doctoral thesis on the political feasibility of basic income.

Registration: Free of charge but required, no later than 6 May 2004, with Thérèse Davio, Chaire Hoover, +32 10 473951 (davio@etes.ucl.ac.be).

PARIS, 24 June 2004: LE DIVIDENDE UNIVERSEL

A conference on the "universal dividend", organised at the Assemblée nationale by Christine Boutin, the French deputy and chair of the Forum des Républicains sociaux (a component of Jacques Chirac's right-of-centre presidential majority) who authored in 2003 a report advocating the introduction of a universal basic income. A background paper for this conference is available (Le Dividende Universel: conjuguer le respect des personnes et la croissance économique. Paris, Forum des Républicains sociaux, 2004, 30p.). It advocates the introduction of a monthly basic income of Euro 300 in France. It refers to several normative and pragmatic arguments, and deals with key objections (work ethic, reciprocity...). The document also includes a short scenario for the concrete implementation of the "universal dividend".

For further information: Lucy Nairac < l.nairac@frs-online.org>

FREIBERG (DE), 25 June 2004: PROSPECTS FOR BASIC INCOME IN GERMANY An expert meeting, followed by a public panel, on basic income in the context of Germany's present social policy debate is being planned in the mining town of Freiberg in former East Germany, with a view to developing a German basic income network.

For further information: Ronald Blaschke and Jens-Eberhard Jahn jahnjepw@freenet.de

4. GLIMPSES OF NATIONAL DEBATES

BELGIUM: Prime Minister's Party in a coalition with Duchatelet's Basic Income Party The Flemish Liberal Party of ruling Prime Minister Guy Verhofstadt (VLD) has decided to form a electoral coalition with VIVANT, a small party whose political platform is partly devoted to a defense of an unconditional monthly basic income of EUR 540. VIVANT was started in 1997 by high-tech businessman and life-member of BIEN Roland Duchâtelet. In national (1999, 2003) and local (2000) elections, it attracted between 1 and 2% of the votes. The VLD-VIVANT cartel is running for the regional and European elections of 13 June 2004 in Flanders (Flemish-speaking) and Brussels (bilingual).

In a joint interview with the weekly magazine Humo (16 March 2004), Verhofstadt and Duchâtelet discuss some of the VIVANT proposals. While Duchâtelet stresses the advantages of his version of basisinkomen (basic income), Verhofstadt recalls that the Flemish liberals were already advocating a negative income tax in the early eighties. Even though he does not explicitly endorse the VIVANT basic income scenario, he argues that some of the reforms which were implemented since 1999 by his two governments, in particular the refundable tax credit for the low-paid, are «incremental steps into the right direction ». On the other hand,, the Flemish liberal party's youth section « Jong VLD » forcefully rejects the idea : « Jong VLD is against an unconditional basic income for all », their chairperson Dewi Van De Vyver wrote, « because it is not means-tested. This would represent a enormous waste of fiscal resources » (De Morgen, 6 February 2004).

More info (in Dutch, French, and English):

http://www.vivant.org http://www.vld.be http://www.jongvld.be

5. RECENT PUBLICATIONS

ENGLISH

DOWDING, Keith, DE WISPELAERE, Jurgen & WHITE, Stuart eds. The Ethics of Stakeholding. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003, 203p., ISBN 1 4039 0580 0. (First editor's address: k.m.dowding@lse.ac.uk.)

A major contribution to the academic debate on unconditional grants, this collection of essays explores the idea of a «stakeholder society» and related policies from an ethical perspective. In their introductory chapter, the editors distinguish (at least) four different types of stakeholder policy: universal basic income, universal basic capital, targeted asset-building, and universal asset-building. The bulk of the book addresses the challenge of competing normative principles underpinning such proposals. These principles include the entitlement' argument (each individual has a right to an equal share of scarce external assets, such as natural resources or job assets), the idea that stakeholding represents an emancipatory strategy (the "individual freedom" argument), that it promotes equality of opportunity, democratic participation, and even efficiency. The volume provides much food for thought in confronting these various lines of argument, and discussing crucial objections. It is divided into two main parts. The first ones charts various stakeholder proposals and tackles the main arguments in favor of them. The second part then takes a critical look at these policies and at the very ideal of stakeholding. It closes with a chapter by Bruce Ackerman, co-author (with A. Alstott) of The Stakeholder Society (Yale U.P., 1999). Royalties will be donated to the UK Citizen's Income Trust. The other authors are Jurgen De Wispelaere (London School of Economics), Keith Dowding (London School of Economics), Cécile Fabre (London School of Economics), Andrew Gamble (University of Sheffield), Robert Goodin (Australian National University), Gavin Kelly (Institute for Public Policy Research UK), Julian Le Grand (London School of Economics), David Nissan (was research fellow, Fabian Society), Carole Pateman (UCLA), Will Paxton (Institute for Public Policy Research UK), Robert van der Veen (University of Amsterdam), Gijs van Donselaar (University of Amsterdam) and Stuart White (University of Oxford)

(http://www.palgrave.com)

VAN DER LINDEN, Bruno. "Active citizen's income, unconditional income and participation under imperfect competition: A normative analysis", *Oxford Economic Papers* 56(1), 2004, pp. 98-117. (Author's address: vanderlinden@ires.ucl.ac.be.)

Various types of basic income schemes are considered to compensate the allocative inefficiencies induced by unemployment benefits. A dynamic general equilibrium model of a unionised economy is developed in which participation to the formal labour market is endogenous and the budget of the State has to balance. It is shown that basic income schemes reduce the equilibrium unemployment rate. Assuming that job-search is costly to monitor, the normative analysis suggests that only the active population should be eligible to the basic income. Introducing such an "active citizen's income" can be a Pareto-improving reform, i.e. one that makes some better off without making anyone worse off.

WRIGHT, Erik O. ed. Redesigning Distribution: Basic Income and Stakeholder Grants as Cornerstones of a More Egalitarian Capitalism, special issue of Politics & Society 32 (1), March 2004, 126p.

http://www.sagepub.com/journals/00323292.htm

In May 2002, Erik O. Wright organised a conference a conference in Madison (Wisconsin) around two papers: Philippe Van Parijs's "Basic Income: A Simple and Powerful Idea for the Twenty-first century", an earlier version of which had been used as a background paper at BIEN's 2000 Berlin Congress; and a paper by Bruce Ackerman and Anne Alstott which contrasts basic income with their own proposal, as defended in The Stakeholder Society, a system in which the government gives all citizens a basic capital as they reach adulthood. This special issue of the journal Politics and Society includes these two papers, followed by a revised version of five of the comments presented at the Wisconsin conference. Stuart White's discussion of objections to both proposals leads to the conclusion that we should consider the possibility of an hybrid form of "citizen's stake" that combines basic capital and basic income features. In his own comment, Erik Olin Wright, argues that a basic income creates "the conditions under which a stable move toward

more equal power within class relations can be achieved" (p.85), and is therefore superior to a basic capital. Carole Pateman also argues that a basic income is to be preferred, because it represents a democratic right which can be compared to universal suffrage: "citizenship and the suffrage are for life, and a basic income is a right that also exists over a citizen's lifetime, whereas a capital grant is a one-off payment at the beginning of adulthood." (p.94). Barbara R. Bergmann is more cautious: she argues that people on the left, especially in the US, should give priority to the development of a generous Swedish-like welfare state before embarking onto a basic income. The final chapter by Edward N. Wolff considers behavioral responses to the stakeholding scheme.

GERMAN

MERLE, Jean-Christophe. "Differenzprinzip, universells Grundeinkommen und Neutralität", in Modelle politischer Philosophie (R. Geiger, J.C. Merle & N. Scarano eds.), Paderborn: Mentis, 2003, 297-315. (Author's address: merle@uni-tuebingen.de.)

The final essay in this Festschrift in honour of Tübingen political philosopher Ottfried Höffe consists in a philosophical discussion of basic income by his assistant and Fichte specialist Jean-Christophe Merle. More specifically, it provides a sophisticated critique of various aspects of Philippe Van Parijs's justification basic income, as articulated in Real Freedom for All (Oxford, 1995). Here is the punchline: "The fundamental mistake in Van Parijs's model of a just society, however original and fascinating it may be, is that it tries to do without a genuine discussion of the global context in which principles of justice need to be applied. Unfortunately, global distributive justice has little to do with gardening or with a behaviour code for Malibu surfers."

6. ABOUT BIEN

BIEN's Executive Committee

Ilona Ostner (iostner@gwdg.de), co-chair
Guy Standing (guystanding@compuserve.com), co-chair
Alexander de Roo MEP (aderoo@europarl.eu.int), treasurer
Claus Offe (coffe@sowi.hu-berlin.de), research coordinator
Philippe Van Parijs (vanparijs@etes.ucl.ac.be), secretary, with support from Yannick Vanderborght (vanderborght@etes.ucl.ac.be)
Jurgen De Wispelaere (j.de-wispelaere@lse.ac.uk), BIENOnline web manager Ingrid Van Niekerk (ivanniekerk@epri.org.za), overseas officer
David Casassas (casassas@eco.ub.es), 2004 conference organiser

Honorary Committee Members

Edwin Morley-Fletcher (m-fletcher@cnel.it)
Robert J. van der Veen (vanderveen@warwick.ac.uk)
Walter Van Trier (Walter.VanTrier@hiva.kuleuven.ac.be)
Steven Quilley (steve.quilley@ucd.ie)

Recognised National Networks

IRELAND - BIEN Ireland Coordinator: John Baker Equality Studies Centre University College Dublin Belfield, Dublin 4, Ireland Tel.: +353-1-716 8365 Fax: +353-1-716 1171

E-mail: John.Baker@ucd.ie

NETHERLANDS - Vereniging Basinkomen

Coordinator: Grietje Lof Wagenaarstraat 184

1093 EB Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Tel.: +31-020-6852712 E-mail: <u>info@basisinkomen.nl</u> Website: <u>www.basisinkomen.nl</u>

SWITZERLAND - BIEN Switzerland

President: Andras November

E-mail: andras.november@iued.unige.ch
Website: www.makessense.ch/basicincome/

SPAIN - Red Renta Basica President: Daniel Raventos Universitat de Barcelona

Departament de Teoria Sociologica

Avda. Diagonal 690, 08034 Barcelona, Spain

Tel.: +34.93.402.90.59 Fax: +34.93.322.65.54

E-mail: < mailto:presidencia@redrentabasica.org > presidencia@redrentabasica.org

Website: www.redrentabasica.org

UK - Citizen's Income Study Centre

Director: Malcolm Torry

Citizens Income Trust, P.O. Box 26586, London SE3 7WY, United Kingdom.

Tel.: 44-20-8305 1222 Fax: 44-20-8305 9944

E-mail: <u>info@citizensincome.org</u> Website: <u>www.citizensincome.org</u>

BIEN'S LIFE MEMBERS

Link to http://www.etes.ucl.ac.be/BIEN/BIEN/Join.htm to find out how to become a Life Member of BIEN. Essentially, it amounts to send EUR 100 to BIEN's account 001 2204356 10 at FORTIS BANK (IBAN: BE41 0012 2043 5610), 10 Rond-Point Schuman, B-1040 Brussel, Belgium

James Meade (+), Gunnar Adler-Karlsson (SE), Maria Ozanira da Silva (BR), Ronald Dore (UK), Alexander de Roo (NL), Edouard Dommen (CH), Philippe Van Parijs (BE), P.J. Verberne (NL), Tony Walter (UK), Philippe Grosjean (BE), Malcolm Torry (UK), Wouter van Ginneken (CH), Andrew Williams (UK), Roland Duchatelet (BE), Manfred Fuellsack (AT), Anne-Marie Prieels (BE), Philippe Desguin (BE), Joel Handler (US), Sally Lerner (CA), David Macarov (IL), Paul Metz (NL), Claus Offe (DE), Guy Standing (CH), Hillel Steiner (UK), Werner Govaerts (BE), Robley George (US), Yoland Bresson (FR), Richard Hauser (DE), Eduardo Matarazzo Suplicy (BR), Jan-Otto Andersson (FI), Ingrid Robeyns (UK), John Baker (IE), Rolf Kuettel (CH), Michael Murray (US), Carlos Farinha Rodrigues (PT), Yann Moulier Boutang (FR), Joachim Mitschke (DE), Rik van Berkel (NL), Francois Blais (CA), Katrin Toens (DE), NN (New York, US), Gerard Degrez (BE), Michael Opielka (DE), Lena Lavinas (BR), Julien Dubouchet (CH), Jeanne Hrdina (CH), Joseph Huber (DE), Markku Ikkala (FI), Luis Moreno (ES), Rafael Pinilla (ES), Graham Taylor (UK), W. Robert Needham (CA), Tom Borsen Hansen (DK), Ian Murray (US), Peter Molgaard Nielsen (DK), Fernanda Rodrigues (PT), Helmut Pelzer (DE), Rod Dobell (CA), Walter Van Trier (BE), Loek Groot (NL), Andrea Fumagalli (IT), Bernard Berteloot (FR), Jean-Pierre Mon (FR), Angelika Krebs (DE), Ahmet Insel (FR), Alberto Barbeito (AR), Ruben Lo Vuolo (AR), Manos

Matsaganis (GR), Jose Iglesias Fernandez (ES), Daniel Eichler (DE), Cristovam Buarque (BR), Michael Lewis (US), Clive Lord (UK), Jean Morier-Genoud (FR), Eri Noguchi (US), Michael Samson (ZA), Ingrid van Niekerk (ZA), Karl Widerguist (US), Al Sheahen (US), Christopher Balfour (AND), Jurgen De Wispelaere (UK), Wolf-Dieter Just (DE), Zsuzsa Frederic Jourdin (FR), Daniel Raventos (ES), Andres Hernandez (CO), Guido Erreygers (BE), Alain Tonnet (BE), Stephen C. Clark (US), Wolfgang Mundstein (AT), Evert Voogd (NL), Frank Thompson (US), Lieselotte Wohlgenannt (AT), Jose Luis Rey Perez (ES), Jose Antonio Noguera (ES), Esther Brunner (CH), Irv Garfinkel (US), Claude Macquet (BE), Bernard Guibert (FR), Margit Appel (AT), Simo Aho (FI), Francisco Ramos Martin (ES), Brigid Reynolds (IE), Sean Healy (IE), Maire Mullarney (IE), Patrick Lovesse (CH), Jean-Paul Zoyem (FR), GianCarlo Moiso (IT), Martino Rossi (CH), Pierre Herold (CH), Steven Shafarman (US), Leonardo Fernando Cruz Basso (BR), Wolfgang Strenmann-Kuhn (DE), Anne Glenda Miller (UK), Lowell Manning (NZ), Dimitris Ballas (GR), Gilberte Ferrière (BE), Louise Haagh (DK), Michael Howard (US), Simon Wigley (TR), Erik Christensen (DK), David Casassas (ES), Paul Nollen (BE), Vriend(inn)en Basisinkomen (NL), Christophe Guene (BE), Alain Massot (CA), Marcel Bertrand Paradis (CA), NN (Geneve, CH), Marc Vandenberghe (BE), Gianluca Busilacchi (IT), Robert F. Clark (US), Theresa Funiciello (US), Al Boag & Sue Williams (AU), Josef Meyer (BE), Alain Boyer (CH), Jos Janssen (NL), Collectif Charles Fourier (+), Bruce Ackerman (US) [141].
